

**Christian Aid Evaluation Management Response to the Pakistan Floods 2010 response
- External evaluation carried out in June 2013 -**

Christian Aid welcomes the opportunity to respond to the report of the evaluation of Christian Aid's response to the Pakistan floods from 2010 and of the report's findings and recommendations. Christian Aid is committed to continued developmental and humanitarian support in Pakistan and aims to contribute to lasting and positive change. Christian Aid acknowledges the context and challenges of undertaking this evaluation and extends its thanks to the evaluation team and to its partners and friends in Pakistan for supporting this process.

Recommendation	Agreed/ rejected/ amended	Action agreed	Person responsible	Date of achievement
Efficiency, impact and effectiveness				
1. Ensure village structures such as WASH committees and VHCs (Village Health Committees) fully 'own' activities and proactively fulfil their obligations <i>(Aimed at all operational partners and sub-partners, with monitoring by Christian Aid)</i>	Agree	<p>Christian Aid will continue to ensure that it and its partners work to facilitate community participation and involvement in projects, to help enable their ownership. CA will further monitor partner projects for community ownership and inclusion.</p> <p>Christian Aid's approach to humanitarian programming is to incorporate accountability mechanisms, and this is an area that corporately CA is further investing in as certified members of HAP, which requires standards are maintained.</p> <p>Christian Aid will continue to provide support to partners for accountability initiatives where required.</p> <p>Christian Aid will share and make these lessons and findings from this evaluation available within Christian Aid through PROMISE.</p> <p>Christian Aid encourages that lessons are shared by partners working on WASH activities.</p>	<p>Christian Aid, Humanitarian Division.</p> <p>Christian Aid, Pakistan Programme.</p>	Ongoing

<p>2. Monitor the 'so what?' of project activities, eg the results of trainings (outputs and outcomes) and not just numbers that attended (inputs). KAP (Knowledge and Practice) surveys, eg those used by CWS-P/A and DKH/SSD may help in this <i>(Aimed at all partners, sub-partners and Christian Aid)</i></p>	<p>Agree</p>	<p>The humanitarian division is currently in the process of creating tools to improve monitoring of the results of our work, and these are being piloted and rolled out to humanitarian programmes. New tools will include those to capture the outcomes of training as well as other types of programme interventions. Formats and templates, including the one Christian Aid uses for humanitarian monitoring, also include requirements to measure and demonstrate the outcomes of projects and the difference they are making.</p> <p>Many of Christian Aid's partners are already using tools and formats to measure the outcomes of their work. Pakistan Team to pilot use of these tools and feed back to the humanitarian performance advisor. This approach will enable performance measurement in the Pakistan programme.</p>	<p>Christian Aid, Humanitarian Division.</p> <p>Christian Aid, Performance staff.</p> <p>Christian Aid, Pakistan Programme.</p>	<p>By the end of 13/14 financial year further tools to be in place internally at Christian Aid staff.</p> <p>March 2014</p>
<p>3. Agencies should revisit all their projects some time later to see what the outcomes of their work really are <i>(Aimed at all partners)</i></p>	<p>Agree</p>	<p>Christian Aid agrees that revisiting and reviewing projects after a longer period of time is an effective way to identify the real impacts of Christian Aid and its partners' work. The Pakistan Floods programme will allocate funding to carry out a study after two years have passed to assess and review outcomes of the programme at that later stage after completion. Exact objectives of the study will be defined and designed to be of use around specific focus areas, possibly on shelter given the proportion of the programme which was in this sector.</p> <p>Christian Aid has a policy in place to commission independent evaluations after humanitarian programmes, and it will continue to carry these out. Lessons are shared or will be made available or taking forward in further humanitarian responses.</p>	<p>Christian Aid, Humanitarian Division.</p> <p>Christian Aid, Pakistan Programme.</p>	<p>September 2015</p>
<p>4. Undertake recovery interventions only if you have the right skills and knowledge, eg in livestock management; if not provide short term relief only to avoid wasted investments</p>	<p>Agree</p>	<p>Although largely Christian Aid's partner base covers a broad scope of experience and expertise, there are also opportunities for Christian Aid to develop new links with other organisations with specific areas of technical knowledge, and these can be followed-up where there are existing gaps. A Christian Aid partner who carried out a livestock project as</p>	<p>Christian Aid, Technical Advisors.</p> <p>Christian Aid, International Department.</p>	<p>March 2014</p>

<i>(Aimed at all partners, with support in good strategic decisions made by partners supported by Christian Aid)</i>		part of CA's Pakistan Floods programme had commissioned an external evaluation of this work, and has identified and agreed how they will take forward lessons learned. Include in new proposals budget for technical expertise.	Christian Aid, Humanitarian Division staff. Christian Aid, Pakistan Programme.	
Quality and relevance				
5. Good assessments must always be carried out, with interventions that reflect genuine need and community capacity <i>(Aimed at all partners)</i>	Agree	The humanitarian division is in the process of putting in place: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Quality standards for humanitarian work (one of which is the existence of a good needs assessment) which all response programme will be reviewed and reported against - A humanitarian programme monitoring format which includes checking the existence of a good - More specific guidance on assessments, what's required and how to conduct them <p>The Pakistan Programme will identify with the help of its partners in Pakistan areas where assessments can be improved in terms of inclusivity and participation when and as disaster responses are required. Efforts will be made to consider how training and capacity building can be carried out in the next year.</p>	Christian Aid, Humanitarian Division. Christian Aid, Performance Advisors. Christian Aid, Pakistan Programme.	November 2013
6. In recovery, always continue to prioritise long term solutions over short term recovery, eg WASH, housing <i>(For all partners, and within Christian Aid)</i>	Agree	This was the approach taken in Christian Aid 's Pakistan floods programme, and Christian Aid is pleased and welcome that this has been identified as a positive finding in the evaluation. Christian Aid will continue to include long term resilience-building interventions in our humanitarian programmes. The further study of outcomes of the Pakistan Floods programme, planned for 2015, will assess the outcomes and effectiveness of Christian Aid's longer term work.	Christian Aid, Humanitarian Division. Christian Aid, Pakistan Programme.	Ongoing September 2015

<p>7. For housing, continue good practice of sharing designs between communities and partners; for more community ownership, build models first for discussion and design revision <i>(For all partners and Christian Aid engaged in building houses)</i></p>	Agree	<p>Shelter is an area where Christian Aid is further improving its knowledge and experience, which has included a study of our housing work across a number of countries carried out in 2013 together with Habitat for Humanity International and Arup.</p> <p>The Christian Aid Emergency Manager for Pakistan will share the findings of this report with other colleagues in Christian Aid through meetings and presentations in the Autumn/Winter of 2013 to take this recommendation forward for sharing good practice for other sectors of work, for example across geographic teams for work relating to agriculture and resilient livelihoods.</p>	<p>Christian Aid, Humanitarian Division staff; including Head of Humanitarian Programme Policy Practice and Advocacy.</p> <p>Christian Aid, Pakistan programme.</p>	November 2013
Downward accountability				
<p>8. Continue and improve Q&A (Quality & Accountability) mechanisms and consider literacy rates and ensure voices of women are heard <i>(For all partners and sub-partners undertaking Q&A mechanisms, and Christian Aid)</i></p>	Agree	<p>At a corporate level Christian Aid is committed to improving and maintaining standards around accountability and quality, across the organisation and in Christian Aid's programme work. Christian Aid is a certified member of HAP and has centralised its approach of working accountably, putting mechanisms in place. Christian Aid's 'Humanitarian Programme Advisor, Accountability' staff member also shares good practice across the organisation and supports roll out of accountability initiatives.</p> <p>Christian Aid provides support to partners on this area, including directly supporting the Quality & Accountability project within Christian Aid's Pakistan programme, to improve accountability to beneficiaries and those affected by the floods.</p> <p>Where possible in Pakistan, Christian Aid will include in new proposals budget lines for the inclusion of Quality & Accountability.</p>	<p>Christian Aid, Humanitarian Division staff;</p> <p>Christian Aid, Humanitarian Programme Advisor Accountability; and Christian Aid staff more broadly</p> <p>Christian Aid, Pakistan Programme.</p>	March 2014
<p>9. Consider whether conditions should be attached to beneficiaries' receipt of goods, eg whether</p>	Agree	<p>Christian Aid will consider this issue on a case-by-case basis, given the very different contexts in which Christian Aid implements humanitarian programmes. Technical support</p>	Christian Aid, Humanitarian Division.	Ongoing

permitted to sell livestock (For all partners and Christian Aid)		and inputs are available internally. Christian Aid partners also have in-depth knowledge on the communities with whom they are working and consulting with around the planning of project approaches.	Christian Aid, Pakistan Programme.	
10. Sensitise people on what 'complaining' is - people might not know what it means (For all partners and sub-partners undertaking complaints mechanisms)	Agree	<p>Christian Aid's work on accountability includes supporting partners to put community based complaints and feedback mechanisms in place in their projects. Existing guidance is clear that this must include sensitising people on what 'complaining' is, as an essential step to designing and setting up the system. The humanitarian division provide training and guidance to Christian Aid staff on these mechanisms and it is a key part of our approach to country level roll out of the HAP standard.</p> <p>The Pakistan Programme will ensure where possible in Christian Aid supported interventions that complaints and feedback mechanisms are in place and are responded to, and moreover beneficiereis are sennitised into providing feedback. Pakistan programme staff will monitor this aspect of programmes.</p>	<p>Christian Aid, Humanitarian Division.</p> <p>Christian Aid, Pakistan Programme.</p>	October 2014
11. CA continues its close working relationship in offering technical expertise to partners, eg in housing (For Christian Aid)	Agree, in part	<p>In the case of Christian Aid's Pakistan programme, technical knowledge in housing is available which has added value to Christian Aid's support, proving a successful factor in the overall programme. In some cases however, it may be necessary to bring in expertise and capacity for other technical areas such as this from outside of the organisation. We therefore recognise the need for technical expertise in supporting programmes, but do not always expect it to come from Christian Aid staff.</p> <p>Where possible, technical support will be included in budgeting in back donor funding applications.</p>	<p>Christian Aid, Humanitarian Division.</p> <p>Christian Aid, Pakistan Programme.</p>	September 2014